

ISSN: 2357-1330

https://doi.org/10.15405/epsbs.2019.09.14

INCoH 2017 The Second International Conference on Humanities

ANALYSIS OF SELECTED FORGED HADITHS ON WOMEN

Roshimah Shamsudin (a)*
*Corresponding author

(a) School of Humanities, Universiti Sains Malaysia, Penang, Malaysia, roshimah@usm.my

Abstract

The spread of forged hadiths is a phenomenon that continues to occur among Muslims today without boundaries, especially with the explosion of sophisticated applications in information technology such as Facebook, WhatsApp, Instagram, and others. The emergence of social media which has become the latest trend for circulating information also makes it easier to spread forged hadiths among Muslims quickly and widely, including hadiths concerning women. This scenario may affect the institution of the Prophet's hadiths as unauthorised hadiths are attributed to the Prophet (p.b.u.h). Thus, this study aims to identify selected forged hadiths concerning women and these hadiths are then analysed based on the thoughts of prominent scholars of hadith. To achieve these objectives, this qualitative study employs literature review to gather the necessary data. The data is then analysed based on inductive and deductive approaches. The study found that among the circulated forged hadiths concerning women, there are hadiths that are categorised as *masyhur bi al-alsinah*, meaning they are well-known among Muslims. Furthermore, the forged hadiths also cover various aspects of women's life, particularly their rights and responsibilities as a mother and wife in marriage.

© 2019 Published by Future Academy www.FutureAcademy.org.UK

Keywords: Analysis, selected forged hadiths, women.



1. Introduction

The process of spreading hadiths from one generation to another has a crucial role in ensuring the survival of the Prophet's hadiths. The hadiths are not only spread orally, instead, the work to keep the Prophet's hadiths alive is further strengthened through the efforts of collecting the hadiths and keeping them in book forms. It is through these efforts that the collections of hadiths attributed to the Prophet (p.b.u.h) have become available in various formats of writing and arrangement. However, the spread of hadiths must be closely monitored because the current situation has seen hadiths being spread to the public without proper vetting. In other words, hadiths are spread without care for their quality (Shamsudin, 2010).

In addition, not all hadiths that reach the Muslims today are graded as *sahih* and *hasan*; there also the ones that are graded weak and forged. It is even more worrying that the spread of forged hadiths has become increasingly prevalent among the Muslim societies today because it can cause negative implications and lead to practices and beliefs that do not originate from the Prophet (p.b.u.h). Furthermore, there are preachers who do not look closely into the status of the hadiths they use in their preachings, religious books which contain hadiths that are not legitimately checked for their status, as well as the thoughts and attitudes of the Muslims themselves that contribute to the spread of forged hadiths and subsequently tarnishing the sacred Islamic teachings (Abdullah & Zarif, 2015).

Many forged hadiths have been circulated and subsequently are believed by the Muslims today, including forged hadiths concerning women. Debates focusing on women become a common issue, and many hadiths are forged both to describe the good or the bad of women which had never been mentioned by the Prophet (p.b.u.h). Thus, this paper will analyse several forged hadiths on women, particularly concerning their role as a wife. The paper will also pose several criticisms and thoughts by the scholars of hadith in relation to the selected hadiths.

2. Problem Statement

The spread of hadiths after the demise of the Prophet (p.b.u.h) had undergone certain phase throughout its historical recording, which development impacts it as an established science. Nevertheless, the challenges and threats are not alien to Hadiths sciences that they are sometimes strong enough to compromise the authenticity and purity of the hadiths; among which is the dissemination of hadiths that has no basis concerning the Prophet (p.b.u.h) known as forged hadith. The spread of the forged hadiths is seen in various matters such as worships, morals, commerce and jurisprudence has negative implications that can lead to deviation from the true teachings of the Prophet (p.b.u.h), thereby affecting the sanctity of Islam and misrepresenting it to the people at large. The widespread of forged hadith has been immense that it permeates into the lives of unsuspecting Muslims, governing their actions and forming their belief components including matters relating to women. The forged hadith concerning women which misrepresented their positions in community are like adding insult to injury when it has already been the popular albeit distorted notion that Islam discriminates women by categorizing them into second class citizens after the men, particularly in light of the rights of women as wives in marriage.

3. Research Questions

- **3.1.** To what extent is the danger of the spread of forged hadiths?
- **3.2.** What are the forms of forged hadiths about women in marriage?

4. Purpose of the Study

- **4.1.** To study the danger of the spreading of forged hadith according to the hadith scholars
- **4.2.** To analyze selected forged hadith in relation to women in marriage.

5. Research Methods

This research was conducted wholly in the qualitative form by way of data collection based on library research. Data collected from various primary sources in the field of hadith whether pertaining to the sciences of hadith such as *Muqaddimah Ibn al-Salah*, biography of the narrators such *as al-Kamil fi al-Du'afa'* by Ibn 'Adi or the prominent hadith compilation books the likes of *Sahih Muslim* in addition to referring to some of the special works which compiled forged hadith such as the work of Ibn al-Jauzi entitled *al-Mawdu'at*, al-Suyuti entitled *al-La'ali' al-Masnu'ah fi Ahadith al-Mawdu'ah* other than the current figure namely al-Albani titled *Silsilah al-Ahadith al-Da'ifah wa al-Mawdu'ah*. The collected data were analyzed based on inductive and deductive methodology.

6. Findings

6.1. Forged hadiths concerning wives.

Forged or *mawdu'* hadith, is a term used by the scholars of hadith to refer to forged news that is spread by attributing it to the Prophet (p.b.u.h). In other words, a forged hadith is forged and is then said to be spoken by the Prophet (p.b.u.h). In terms of hierarchy, the status of forged hadith is lower than that of weak hadith, as forged hadiths cannot even be listed as weak hadiths. In terms of narration, Islamic scholars agree that forged hadiths must not be narrated once it is found that they are forged regardless in whatever meaning, unless it is explained that the hadiths are false (Al-Ṭahhan, 1981). This is different compared to weak hadith which can still be narrated in certain matters such as *al-Targhīb wa al-Tarhīb* (Ibn al-Ṣalāh, n.d.).

Ibn Hajar (2008) said it is prohibited for us to hold onto forged hadiths. However, some practitioners of Tasawwuf claim that it is permissible for narrations related to *al-Targhīb wa al-Tarhīb*. This is a huge mistake because *al-Targhīb wa al-Tarhīb* is included in Shariah law and deceive upon the name of Prophet Muhammad (p.b.u.h) is regarded as one of the major sins. Apart from forged hadiths related to *al-Targhīb* dan *al-Tarhīb*, there are also many forged hadiths related to women or specifically, wives, and this is an issue that is often discussed and in fact, the forged hadiths are often used as justifications in several problems concerning women. In this study, several forged hadiths regarding wives have been selected, including:

1. Prohibition to look at wife's private part during intercourse

Translation: When any one of you has intercourse with his wife or slave, let him not look

at her private parts, because this causes blindness.

This hadith is graded as forged. Ibn al- Jawzī noted in al-Mawdu'āt that this hadith was reported

by Ibn Adī from Hisyam bin Khālid from Baqiyyah from Ibn Juraij from 'Aṭā from Ibn Abbas as marfu'.

Ibn al-Jawzī said according to Ibn Hibban, Baqiyyah who was one of the narrators in the sanad of the

hadith had narrated it from narrators who were kadhdhāb (deceivers) and he had hidden the names of the

narrators. Baqiyyah had also left out the names of weak narrators and claimed that they were equal to the

authentic narrators (Ibn Jawzī, 1966). Al-Şuyuţi had quoted Ibn Hātim in the book al-'Ilal from his father

that it was reported by Ibn Hajar, Ibn al-Qattan had mentioned in "Kitāb Ahkām al-Nazr" that Baqī bin

Makhlad had narrated from Hisyam bin Khālid from Baqiyyah from Ibn Juraij and both had been graded

as forged. This view opposed that of Ibn al-Jawzī dan Ibn al-Ṣalāh, as they both considered the sanad for

this matan as jayyid (Al-Suyūti, 1975). However, al-Albani (1992) rejected this view by saying that Ibn

al-Şalah had only examined the surface of the hadith without looking deeper into the flaws of the sanad

as emphasised by Abū Hātim.

Ibn Abī Hātim as quoted by al-Albani (1992) believed Baqiyyah had wrongly reported the hadith

from Hisyam and according to him, Baqiyyah had been categorised as a mudallis narrator. Ibn Abi Hātim

also graded the hadith as mawdu' la aşl lah. Al-Dhahabi, also acknowledged this in the kitab al-Mīzān; he

even said that Hisyam had reported the hadith from thiqah (reliable) narrators from Damsyik but he had

altered their narrations.

This has been discussed through hadith from 'Aisyah as narrated by al-Bukhari and Muslim, and

the narration in Sahih Muslim (2006) is as follows:

كنت أغتسل أنا ورسول الله ﷺ من إناء بيني وبينه واحد, فيبادرني , حتى أقول : دع لي , دع لي

Translation: The Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) and I used to bathe

from one vessel, he was faster so I said: Leave some for me! Leave some for me!

It can be discerned from this hadith that it is permissible for one to look at his wife's private part.

This hadith was also supported by Ibn Hibban from Sulaimān bin Musā when he was asked by a man

about looking at his wife's private part, and he then asked 'Ata' about it. The question was then brought

to 'Aisyah, so 'Aisyah had mentioned this hadith (Ibn Hibban, n.d.; Al-Albani, 1992).

2. Encouragement to marry virgins.

Translation: Marry virgins because they are pleasant with words, and they have healthy

wombs to birth children, and a very deep love.

This hadith was reported by al-Wāhidī from Ishāq bin Basyar al-Kāhilī from 'Abdullah b. Idris al-

Madanī from his father from his grandfather as marfu'. This hadith is graded forged because al-Kāhilī

was a deceiver according to al-Dāraquṭnī, and al-Kāhilī was one of the people who had forged hadith (Al-

146

https://doi.org/10.15405/epsbs.2019.09.14 Corresponding Author: Roshimah Shamsudin Selection and peer-review under responsibility of the Organizing Committee of the conference eISSN: 2357-1330

Albani, 1992). There is a hadith which he had narrated with good sanad and almost similar expression (Al-Albani, 1995), which is narrated by Ibn Majah as follows:

Translation: Chose to marry virgins, for their words are pleasant, their wombs fertile and they are contented with less.

This hadith was reported by Ibrāhīm bin al-Mundhir al-Hizamī from Muhammad bin Ṭalhah al-Taimī from 'Abd al-Rahman Ibn Sālim bin 'Utbah bin 'Uwaim bin Sā'idah al-Anṣārī from his father from his grandfather. However, this hadith had been criticized by several scholars of hadith such as Ibn Hibban who said Muhammad bin Talhah was a *thiqah* narrator but he seemed to have been mistaken, while al-Bukhari had graded hadith reported by 'Abd al-Rahman bin Sālim bin 'Utbah as invalid (*lam yaṣih hadithuhu*) (Ibn Majah, n.d.).

3. Prohibition for a wife to leave home without her husband's permission.

Translation: Any wife who goes out except with permission from her husband will receive wrath from Allah until she returns to her home or until her husband has forgiven her.

This hadith was reported by Abī Nuʻaim with the sanad from Ibrahim bin Hudabah from Anas as a *marfu* 'hadith (Al-Albani, 1992). Al-Khaṭīb said Ibrahim had reported hadith from Anas falsely (*bāṭil*). Meanwhile, Ibn Maʻin had graded Ibrahim *kadhdhāb khabith*. Al-Dhahabī also believed that Ibrahim had falsely reported hadith from narrators from Baghdad and others. Abu Hātim also called Ibrahim *kadhdhāb* (Al-Khatīb, 2001).

Ibn Hibban had graded Ibrahim as *dajjāl min al-dajjājilah*. According to al-Albani (1992), this hadith, which was narrated by al-Khaṭib and followed by al-Munāwī in the book *Fayḍ al-Qadīr* had been criticized by al-Suyuti who said:

To surmise, the writer (al-Munawi) stated that al-Khatib had made *takhrij* (revealed the original source) for the hadith and acknowledged that the narrator (Ibrahim bin Hudabah) was a *talbis fāhish* narrator so there was a huge confusion. Ahmad bin Hanbal then said: Ibrahim bin Hudabah did not have anything, because he had to himself a lot of *munkar* hadiths. Al-Dhahabī in *al-Du'āfa'* said: he was a deceiver (*kadhdhāb*). Al-Munawi should have left out his name from the book.

Apart from this hadith, there is also another forged hadith that is expressed differently but still carries the same meaning, which is as follows:

Translation: A wife who leaves her husband's house without his permission is condemned by the whole universe from morning until night, unless she earns his forgiveness.

This hadith is also a forged hadith that had been reported by the same narrator for the above hadith. Abū Hudabah, whose full name was Ibrahim bin Hudabah, was matrūk, his hadith from Anas is false (bātil) (Al-Albani, 1992).

4. The Prophet's (p.b.u.h) encouragement to reduce *mahr*

Translation: The best of women of my ummah who are blessed are those whose face shine and whose mahr is less.

This hadith is false (bāṭil). Al-Wāhidī had reported it in al-Wasīṭ from Muhammad bin Sulaiman bin Abī Karimah from Hisyam bin 'Urwah from his father from 'Aisyah as a marfu' hadith. Al-Albani said the sanad for this hadith is wāhin jiddan. Meanwhile, al-'Uqaili graded Ibn Sulaimān's narrations from Hisyam as bāṭil lā aṣl lah, and this hadith is one of the narrations (Al-Albani, 1992). Ibn Abī Hātim had graded this hadith and its sanad from Ibn Abī Karimah. He had determined the sanad for the hadith as bāţil and that Ibn Abī Karimah was a weak narrator (Ibn Abī Hātim, 2006).

There is another hadith that mentioned *mahr* for women, which is as follows:

Translation: The best woman of my ummah are those who are beautiful and whose mahr is less.

This hadith was reported by Ibn 'Adī from al-Husain bin al-Mubārak al-Tabarānī from Ismā'il 'Iyāsh from Hisyam bin 'Urwah from his father from 'Aisyah as a marfu' hadith. According to Ibn 'Adī, the matan of the hadith is munkar; ikhtilat has occured if the report by Ismail bin 'Iyāsh originated from among the Hijaz and Iraq, and if the report originated from the people of Syam then the report is thabit. However, the actual problem with the hadith was caused by al-Husain bin al-Mubārak, not Ismā'il bin 'Iyāsh, because the hadiths reported by al-Husain have been determined as munkar (Ibn 'Adī, n.d). Meanwhile, al-Albani had quoted words from al-Dhababi from Ibn 'Adī, that al-Husain had been accused to be a liar (Muttaham) and in fact, description of his biography cannot be found in kitab al-Kamil (Al-Albani, 1992).

5. A wife's complaint towards her husband.

Translation: When a wife says to her husband: I have not once seen the good in you, then all her good deeds will become void.

This hadith was reported by Ibn 'Asākir from Salām bin Razin (originally Raziq) from 'Umar bin Salīm from Yūsūf bin Ibrāhim from Anas from 'Aisyah as a *marfu*' hadith. Al-Albani said the sanad becomes invalid because of Yūsūf. Ibn Hibban said that Yūsūf had falsely reported a hadith as coming from Anas when that was not true and he should not have reported it from him. Al-Bukhari had determined Yūsūf as "Ṣāhib 'Ajā'ib", which means a person who loves to conduct peculiar deeds, and this status is actually equal to weak. Meanwhile, according to al-Dhahabi, Salām bin Razin was an unknown narrator and his hadith is bāṭil (Al-Albani, 1992).

6. Placing hand on wife's head during intercourse while praying.

Translation: When one marries, and he has intercourse with wife, then he should put his hand on his wife's head and say: O Allah, bestow your blessings upon me and my wife, bestow my people for me, bestow me for her, and bestow her for me, unite us in good, and if we separate, separate us in good.

This hadith was reported by al-Ra'īs al-Thaqafī from Muslim bin 'Īsā bin Muslim al-Ṣaffār al-Muadhin from 'Abdullah bin Dāwūd al-Kharībī from al-A'masy from Shaqīq from al-Aswād from 'Abdullah bin Mas'ūd as a *marfu* 'hadith. Al-Albani said the hadith is graded forged because of flaws with its narrator al-Ṣaffar, while other narrators are acknowledged as *thiqah*. Al-Dāraquṭni said al-Ṣaffar was *matrūk*. This hadith was also included in the book *Talkhiṣ al-Mustadrak* after a hadith on *Manāqib* Fāṭimah and it is graded forged from Muslim bin 'Īsā (Al-Albani, 1992).

7. A woman who marries without a guardian is considered as an adulterer

Translation: If a woman gets herself married without a guardian, she is considered as an adulterer.

Al-Khaṭib had included this hadith in his book *al-Tārikh* through sanad by Muhammad bin 'Abd al-Rahman al-Ṭabarī from al-Husain bin Ismā'il bin Khālid al-Ṭabarī from Yūsūf bin Sa'īd Abū al-Muthannā from Abū 'Aṣamah from Maqātil bin Hayyan from Qubaiṣah bin Zu'aib from Muadh bin Jabal as a *marfu*' hadith (Al-Khatīb, 2001).

According to al-Albani (1992), the flaw with this hadith was caused by Abū 'Aṣamah whose full name was Nūh bin Abī Maryam. Ibn al-Mubārak said "he had forged hadith like al-Mu'alli bin Hilāl". Abū 'Ali al-Naisabūrī also said, "he was a *kadhdhābin*", meaning he was a deceitful narrator. According to Abū Sa'īd al-Naqash, "he was a narrator who had reported many forged hadiths." Muslim and al-Dāraquṭnī said Abū 'Aṣamah had forged hadith concerning *Faḍā'il al-Quran*. Al-Khaṭib also wrote about Muhammad bin 'Abd al-Rahman al-Ṭabarī but there was no *jarh wa ta'dil* regarding him.

Islamic scholars have discussed this issue. According to the Maliki, Shāfi'ī dan Hanbali *madhhabs*, legally, a woman cannot conduct her own marriage even if she is able to, which means her marriage must be conducted through a guardian. However, the Hanafi *madhhab* allows women to conduct their own marriage no matter if they are widows or virgins (Zain *et al*, 2014). If it is true that a woman will be considered as an adulterer if she conducts her own marriage without a guardian, then Abu Hanifah certainly would not have allowed this for there will be bad consequences for the woman.

7. Conclusion

The wide spread of forged hadiths among Muslim societies today is a result of many contributing factors. The factors include the attitude of the preachers themselves who do not look closely into the status of the hadiths they use in their preachings, religious books which contain hadiths that are not legitimately checked for their status, as well as the thoughts and attitudes of the Muslims themselves. In terms of practice, it is clearly prohibited to practice from forged hadiths because these hadiths are not proven to have originated from the Prophet Muhammad (p.b.u.h). In fact, reporting them without explanation is a sin and is considered as deceive upon the Prophet (p.b.u.h).

In addition, it can be surmised from the earlier discussion that hadiths concerning women as wives include ones that are forged. Hadiths about prohibition to look at wife's private part during intercourse, prohibition for a wife to to leave home without her husband's permission, the Prophet's (p.b.u.h) encouragement of lowering mahr and other selected hadiths as discussed earlier have been graded as forged by the scholars of hadith because the narrators in their *sanad* have been identified by scholars as deceivers. Thus, these hadiths cannot be accepted as valid words spoken by the Prophet (p.b.u.h). Practicing invalid hadiths or even worse, forged ones, must be avoided. This is a matter that must not be taken lightly because it could affect the practice of the Muslims, and thus tarnishing the Prophet's hadith.

Acknowledgments

This work is part of USM Short Term Research Grant: 304/PHUMANITI/6313200 which has been allocated for the researcher for research between 2015-2017 under the title The Study of Women's Rights and Roles according to the Perspective of Hadith: Focus on Women's Development in Malaysia.

References

Abdullah, W. H., & Zarif, M. M. M. (2015). Hadith Palsu dalam Karya-Karya Keagamaan di Alam Melayu dan Kesannya Terhadap Masyarakat (Forged hadiths in religious works in the malay world and its impact on society) in Khader Ahmad, Faisal Ahmad Shah, Monika @ Munirah Abd Razak.

Salah faham terhadap sunnah isu dan penyelesaiannya [Misunderstanding of sunnah issues and solutions]. (p. 249-264). Kuala Lumpur: Universiti Malaya.

Al-Albani, M. N. D. (1992). Silsilah al-ahādith al-da'ifah wa al-mawḍū'ah. Riyaḍh: Maktabah al-Ma'ārif.

Al-Albani, M. N. D. (1995). Silsilah al-ahadith al-sahīhah. Riyaḍh: Maktabah al-Ma'ārif.

Al-Khaṭīb, A. A. T. (2001). Tārīkh madīnah al-salām. Beirūt: Dār al-Gharb al-Islāmī.

Al-Suyūṭi, J. D.A.R. (1975). *Al-la'ālī' al-maṣnū'ah fī al-ahādith al-mawḍū'ah*. v.2. Beirūt: Dār al-Ma'rifah.

Al-Ţahhan, M. (1981). Taysīr musṭalāh al-hadith. Iskandariah: Markaz al-Hudā li al-Dirāsāt.

Ibn Abī Hātim, A. R. A. H. (2006). Kitāb al-'ilal. Riyādh: Maktabah al-Malik Fahd al-Waṭaniah.

Ibn 'Adī, A. A. J. (n.d.). Al-kāmil fī du 'afā' al-Rijāl. Beirut: Dār Kutub al-'Ilmiah.

Ibn Hajar, A. A. M. (2008). Taisīr nuzhah al-nazar fi muṣṭalāh al-hadith. Ṭanṭā: Dār al-Diyā'.

Ibn Hibbān, A. B. F. (n.d.). Şaḥih ibn hibban bi tartīb ibn bulbān. Beirut: Mu'assasah al-Risālah.

Ibn Jawzī, A. R. A. (1966). Al-mawḍū'āt. v. 2. Madinah: Maktabah al-Salafiyah.

Ibn Mājah, M. Y. Q. (n.d.). Sunan ibn mājah. Cairo: Dār Ihyā' al-Kutub al-'Arabiyah.

Ibn al-Ṣalāh, U. A. R. S. (n.d.). 'Ulūm al-hadith li ibn al-salāh. (n.p.).

Muslim, M. H. Q. N. (2006). Şahīh muslim. Riyadh: Dār Ṭaybah.

Shamsudin, R. (2010). Muhammad nāṣir al-dīn al-albanī dan metodologi penentuan hadith da if: satu kajian silsilah al-da ifah wa al-mawdū ah (Muhammad nasir al-din al-albani and his methodology in determining weak hadith: a study of silsilah al-ahadith al-dai fah wa al-maudu ah). Unpublished doctoral thesis. Universiti Sains Malaysia. Penang, Malaysia.

Zain, M.N.M. (2014). Hak wanita mengadakan syarat semasa pembentukan perkahwinan (The rights of women to impose conditions in the marriage contract). *KANUN Jurnal undang-undang Malaysia* (*KANUN journal of malaysian law*), v.1. Kuala Lumpur: Dewan Bahasa dan Pustaka. pp. 70-87.