

## 18<sup>th</sup> PCSF 2018

### Professional Culture of the Specialist of the Future

#### REALIZATION OF STUDENT ACADEMIC RIGHTS TOWARDS THE BOLOGNA PROCESS: CHALLENGES AND SOLUTIONS

Galina Romanova (a), Maksim Romanov (b), Marina Maznichenko (c)\*, Matvei Oborin (d)

\*Corresponding author

(a) Sochi State University 26a Sovietskaya Street, Sochi, Russia, romanova@sutr.ru, +7-862-264-85-03

(b) Sochi State University 26a Sovietskaya Street, Sochi, Russia, romanovmaxim@mail.ru, +7-918-109-64-98

(c) Sochi State University 26a Sovietskaya Street, Sochi, Russia, maznichenkoma@mail.ru, +7-918-606-17-39

(d) Perm Institute (branch) of the Russian Economic University named after G.V. Plekhanov, 57, Gagarina boulevard, Perm, Russia; Perm State National Research University, 15, Bukirev Street, Perm, Russia; Perm State Agrarian and Technological University ac. D.N. Pryanishnikov, 23, Petropavlovskaya street, Perm, Russia; Sochi State University 26a Sovietskaya Street, Sochi, Russia, recreachin@rambler.ru, +7-902-640-23-28

#### *Abstract*

This article focuses on the topical issue of realization and enjoyment of academic rights of higher education students in the current political and educational settings, the Bologna process, and the humanitarian paradigm of education. It outlines the key conditions and dialectical contradictions of realization of such freedom. Having defined the problems, we designed a classification of the typical challenges in the field of realization of student academic rights in the Russian Federation, recognizing the urgency of proper measures to be taken both on the national, and on the international levels. The article explores outcomes of the related research conducted by Russian and international scholars. The conclusion is drawn that such studies of challenges posed for realization of student academic rights have been mostly fragmentary, whereas their integrated research and comprehensive resolution would be in order. Three clusters of issues in realization of student academic rights are described and illustrated by specific examples: regulatory and legal challenges, administrative and technical challenges, psychological and pedagogical challenges. A complex of possible solutions to the related problems is recommended to government bodies (including the Ministry of Science and Higher Education), education establishments, and students (regulatory and legal, administrative and technical, psychological and pedagogical solutions).

© 2018 Published by Future Academy [www.FutureAcademy.org.UK](http://www.FutureAcademy.org.UK)

**Keywords:** Academic rights of higher education students, classification of typical challenges, humanitarian paradigm of education, solutions to the problems of realization and enjoyment of student academic rights, the Bologna process», typical challenges in the field of realization of student academic rights.



This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 Unported License, permitting all non-commercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

## 1. Introduction

Eligibility for rights and freedom is an essential condition for social life, self-accomplishment, and enactment of social roles (Mill, 2013). The right to education stated in international legislation and the Constitution is a key to meaningful preparation for such roles. Enjoyment of this right involves: the students' eligibility for other academic rights and corresponding responsibilities; complete realization of student academic rights by the state, by education establishments, and by students (the rights holders).

The challenge of realization and enjoyment of student academic rights gains momentum during the period of study at the University, which is the stage of socialization of the rights holder. Nevertheless, this issue remains largely unexplored, especially within the context of the Bologna process and its fundamental principles; and it is not given due attention in the education and management domains of Russian universities. Our studies have revealed that the advancement towards realization of student academic rights in Russia needs to be furthered. Despite the fact that the number of academic rights of students is growing in the current setting, the polls have shown that every second student has suffered to this or that extent from disregard or deprivation of their rights guaranteed by laws of the Russian Federation (Belova, 2015). Saint-Petersburg State University is one of the Russian universities that have pioneered empirical research in this area. In 2015, this university analyzed the teachers' and students' attitudes to academic rights and freedoms. Sochi State University is currently conducting a study of the legal norms and legislation pertaining to academic rights of students and is designing recommendations on how to improve their implementation.

The subject matter of academic rights and their implementation procedures feature a number of prominent contradictions: between the freedom of universities and students and the tight control over their activities by the State (legislation, education standards, the state-run accreditation procedures, etc.), especially in countries with a large share of public funding in support of higher education; between the enjoyment of rights and the implementation of related responsibilities (both by students, and by educational organizations); between individualization, and unification (standardization) of educational programs; between the interests of the state, of educational institutions and of students; between the need to take into account the globalization processes, and to maintain national identities in the course of realization of academic rights; between legal and moral norms in realization of academic rights of students; between market orientation (of education services on the education market), and social, cultural value of education (education as an incentive for the state's intellectual, cultural developments); between the legally available rights, and the lack of necessary conditions for their actual realization. Hence, there arises the question of how to enjoy academic rights efficiently, avoiding such contradictions?

Technicalities of realization of academic rights of higher education students in the Russian Federation reflect the specific attitudes towards higher education formed yet within the Soviet system, which guaranteed absolutely free of charge access to higher education on the basis of a tough merit-based competition, along the strictly regulated education path (state education standards with a tiny optional component). Changes that started in the system of higher education in Russia after the signing of the Bologna Agreement have fundamentally modified its framework and principles, yet the mindset of participants of educational process has remained the same towards some of its aspects, thus significantly hampering the realization of academic rights. While outside Russia, the specific approaches to

development of higher education within the framework of the Bologna system have been related to its historical genesis (Helmholtz, 2003; Ortega & Gasset, 2010), they had to be imposed in Russia in the somewhat top-down manner; and as a result, many students and teachers are not ready yet to adopt and enjoy them (Timofeeva, 2015). For example, a poll of teachers conducted at 15 Russian universities revealed, that 57.6% of the 350 respondents were convinced that the Soviet system of education used to be much more superior, and Russia's introduction of the Bologna reform has worsened its quality.

Another feature is attributed to the fact that the contemporary world is highly dynamic, prone to ongoing changes in economic, political, social spheres, including modernization and reforming of education. In such circumstances, mechanisms of realization of academic rights of students should not be focused only on the current situation, and would rather serve future trends (globalization, development of networking formats, educational electronic environment, etc.), and be a drive for advanced development of higher education.

## **2. Problem Statement**

Domestic and international studies, dedicated to some challenges posed for realization of certain academic rights of students, examine them in a fragmentary manner within legal, economic, political, sociological, pedagogical, psychological contexts. For example, Timofeeva addresses the issues of modernization, related to the right of Russian citizens to education, within historical and political landscape; her research has detected main contradictions inside the state policy in this sphere (Timofeeva, 2015). Enjoyment of student rights to receive academic scholarships is researched by Mutagirov within a legal framework (Mutagirov, 2014). Kirillovih explores administrative and technical challenges posed for legal regulation of the student academic right to the readmission (Kirillovih, 2017a) and transfer (Kirillovih, 2017b) of students. According to Bredneva (2009), the main challenges impeding realization of academic rights are corruption, and students' inertia, as well as insufficient information support from the universities.

International researchers study realization of student academic rights in connection with the analyses of issues related to the morale and conduct standards expected of students, including measures countering racial and ethnic inequalities in education (Skiba, Eckes, & Brown, 2009), as well as in the context of developing fruitful interaction of teachers and students (Zyngier, 2007), in connection with the research in prevention of professional deformation of a teacher (Covell, McNeil, & Howe, 2009), provisions for psychocorrective support (Ward & Birgden, 2007), school-based psychologist's input (Burden, 1993). We should note, that such research projects feature a prominent humanitarian vector: new techniques are designed to stimulate students' emotional commitment to their learning ('students' engagement in school') (Veiga, Burden, Pavlovic, Moura, & Galvão, 2014; Razinkina et al., 2018), elimination of racial and ethnic inequalities in disciplinary procedures and actions (Skiba, Eckes, & Brown, 2009). Our analysis has revealed that both domestic and foreign research projects lack systematic descriptions of existing challenges for realization of academic rights of students and do not suggest any possible solutions. Therefore, a relevant research topic should focus on detection of typical problems in realization of student academic rights, followed by their systems classification and design of a set of recommended measures addressing them.

### **3. Research Questions**

We have compiled a list of the following research questions: what indicator can alert that there may be problems in realization of academic rights of higher education students? What methods can be used to detect the existing problems? Which problems can be considered typical? How can they be systemized? Which measures should be undertaken by the state, education establishments and students, to prevent or eliminate the existing problems?

### **4. Purpose of the Study**

The purpose of our research is to detect, classify and describe most typical challenges for realization of student academic rights at higher education establishments in the Russian Federation from the standpoint of the key principles and values of the Bologna Declaration and humanitarian educational paradigm, and to come up with practical recommendations for their prevention and elimination.

### **5. Research Methods**

To achieve this goal, we have applied the following research methods: analytical method that involves desk research in scientific literature, strategic and legal documents, local acts of universities, law enforcement and compliance practices related to realization of academic rights of students; formal legal method allowing to disclose systemic links across the legal framework, and find regulatory features in bylaws; method of content analysis of open source data (sites of universities, research conducted by Russian and international researchers, etc.); systematization and classification of typical challenges for realization of academic rights of students, and design of their solutions; project-based method: development of recommendations on how to improve the national framework for realization of academic rights of students as part of humanitarian education paradigm. Our research methodology is based on: the systems approach – analysis of the interrelated domains of students' enjoyment and universities' realization of different academic rights and relevant responsibilities; the dialectical approach – detection of key dialectical contradictions in the course of realization of academic rights of students.

### **6. Findings**

Our analysis has led us to the following conclusions:

**6.1.** Indicators that can alert that there are problems in realization of student academic rights may include: disparity between rights declared and their realization; dissatisfaction of students as rights-holders, complaints submitted to the university administration or regional administrations, petitions forwarded to relevant ministries, Executive Office of President of the Russian Federation, etc., legal claims; a list of challenges compiled by the university administration; the degree of students' involvement and engagement in realization and protection of their rights.

**6.2.** Challenges for realization of student academic rights can be detected by means of polls conducted among students, teachers and administrative staff of the university; or by means of desk research and analysis of federal legislation, regulations and local acts of the university; through

observation of governance of educational institutions, students' direct communication with administration staff; analysis of web sites of the universities; analysis of business correspondence and files of universities (letters, memos, reports, records of inspections, etc.); analysis of the law enforcement practice.

**6.3.** The typical challenges for realization of student academic rights are those issues that have been identified and occur systematically at universities across different RF regions.

**6.4.** Our analysis has revealed that all the existing challenges posed for realization of student academic rights can be classified into 3 clusters of issues by factors (reasons) of their occurrence:

#### **6.4.1. Regulatory and Legal Challenges**

– *Lack of specific mechanisms and procedures for realization of student academic rights in the Russian Federation legislation, that would be similar to international regulations and legal instruments* (the European Convention 'On Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms', Universal Declaration on Human Rights, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, etc.), *some discrepancy between international legal commitments of Russia* (the 'European Higher Education Area (EHEA)' Declaration, The Convention 'Against Discrimination In Education', 'International Agreement On Cooperation In The Field Of Education' of May 15, 1992 etc.), *and legislation of countries participating in educational partnerships*. These inconsistencies were mentioned quite a long time ago in the works of domestic scientists, in particular (Kuzminov, & Yudkevich, 2007; Lazutova, Mikhailuk, & Tarasova, 2003). Despite the fact that the updated legal framework in the Russian Federation has integrated certain concepts of the Bologna Declaration there are still some discrepancies, including the fact that specific procedures and mechanisms for these concepts' implementation have not been outlined so far. Much criticism has been forwarded to the institutions of higher education for reflection, but either university are not ready to develop such mechanisms, or the conditions for their implementation are not ready yet.

– *The pro forma adoption of the declared rights in the federal legislation, the lack of necessary bylaws*. Federal legislation in the Russian Federation declares the student academic rights in a pro forma (blanket) manner with reference to the relevant bylaws and regulations, while the existing regulations in some cases do not contain the outline of all possible situations of their implementation, do not have projections into the future, do not take into account education development trends. The federal legal framework also does not describe mechanisms of realization of students' right to transfer and accumulate academic merits, credits mastered at another education establishment as part of the ECTS system, nor the right to participate in the syllabus design and selection of learning materials, nor the right to transfer from an unaccredited university to an accredited university, etc.

– *Gaps in internal/local bylaws of universities regarding regulations and procedures for realization of academic rights*: in some cases, bylaws of universities prescribe eligibility of academic rights of students by means of references to federal legislation, while it does not disclose the procedures for their realization; the local acts very rarely prescribe procedures for dismissal and transfer of students from higher education establishments which licenses/accreditations for educational activities have been suspended/revoked; in the statutes of a number of universities there is no mentioning of the student right to academic sabbatical; the right to transfer to other education establishments academic credits and merits

for the learned courses and disciplines is provided by only a few establishments; such transfers are not outlined in local acts; bylaws of most universities do not describe procedures for submitting appeals about violations of such rights and freedoms; penalties for non-compliance are not established. It should also be noted that universities very rarely have relevant provisions for student academic rights (such provisions have been found only at the private institution - the Baltic Institute of Ecology, Politics and Law).

– Legal inconsistencies in bylaws of the higher education establishments: thus, in some texts, the phrase ‘as a rule’ is used, provoking chances for different interpretations and corruption. For example, the statutes of some universities include provisions for ‘readmission of a student, who has been expelled without any plausible excuse, <such readmission> to be enacted by the University Rector, after the related petition is submitted by the Dean within five years after the student dismissal, **as a rule** for a readmission fee’.

– *Inconsistency between federal legislation and the changed educational environment.* In particular, the existing legislation does not regulate the manner in which the students’ mobility can be arranged in cases when the transfer is because of the suspension or revocation of a license or state accreditation of their education establishment, and the study program has been provided in an on-line networking or IT-based distance learning mode: the question is whether an education establishment deprived of the state accreditation is obliged to transfer the student only to an establishment, which can also provide the study program in a networking mode (using remote technologies).

#### **6.4.2. Administrative and Technical Challenges, associated with the university administration's activities pertaining to realization of student academic rights**

– *Contradictions between approaches to realization of various academic rights of students:* for example, realization of the right of a student to participate in designing the syllabus hampers to a certain extent realization of the right to transfer to another institution or to other educational programs: a student in case of transfer has to be examined/tested in a large number of disciplines. The problem is that only a few Russian universities recognize academic credits and merits in optional disciplines studied at the previous institution. In most cases, electives are considered program deficiencies, and (re)examination (retake) of any outstanding assessments are required. In case of restrictions imposed by bylaws of the host university with regard to the maximum number of different disciplines/modules in the previously studied curriculum, when a student is transferring from another university, the examination board may decide to accept the student to a lower level of the course which extends the period of study and leads to additional financial costs (in the case of education on a fee-paying basis).

– *Contradictions between realization of academic rights and compliance with the corresponding responsibilities:* for example, the right to receive quality education would not be completely realized, when a student fails to fulfill the commitment to diligently study the educational program, attend classes and sessions; the same responsibility correlates with realization of the right to receive academic scholarships. As for court rulings about academic rights, there were cases when a university failed to perform adequately its responsibilities to provide quality educational services: for example, a student was expelled from a university for academic failure, while the student’s failure was a result of teachers’ failure

to deliver their responsibilities (teachers arriving late to work, missing classes, inappropriate/poor quality teaching, etc.).

– *Conflicts of interests of a university and a student in realization of academic rights*: for example, in the event of termination of the university's operation (e.g., a scheduled close-down of the university department or branch), revocation of a license, or revocation / expiration of the state accreditation in some particular educational program, etc. - the universities are often not economically interested to notify in writing their students, parents (legal representatives) of juvenile students, and customers of educational services, within the prescribed period of time, of the reasons for the forthcoming transfer to other educational institutions, because the students may decide, when notified in advance, to write applications for voluntary withdrawal, and this kind of expulsion would reduce revenues of the university if it provides educational services for tuition fees; on the other side, the students are interested in a timely transfer to other universities and in early exams or retake of any outstanding assessments, so that to start their study at the host university from the beginning of the new semester.

The university may not be interested even in realization of the right of a student to transfer to another establishment, as this would mean a vacant seat on the state-run program, or loss of revenues on a fee-based program. Another example is the student academic right to study, on top of the core curriculum, some optional subjects (modules) and elective courses in the major academic field (specialty), some *additional* disciplines, subjects (modules) and courses of the same university according to the provisions adopted by the university, as well as academic disciplines, subjects (modules) and courses taught at other education establishment, Administration faces the challenge of having to revise the workload of teachers in such disciplines; besides, there is no framework for students' selection of subjects and enrollment/distribution in corresponding groups. This process is also prone to difficulties due to the students' unawareness of such rights (Belova, 2015).

– *Pro forma realization of student academic rights (as a formality)*. Examples include the right to participate in designing the syllabus, i.e. the content of education: formally, students have the right to choose modules/electives, but in practice, most universities teach disciplines that have been chosen in advance by the chair, so students are asked to write applications for 'choosing' these very disciplines. A similar situation exists for election of the fields of study: universities teach what the majority of students have chosen. The minority of students, having made their own choice, are forced to revise their decision and agree to study what most students have chosen. In other words, whatever the few have chosen is neglected in favor of the majority.

– *Poorly arranged university's communication with students about their academic rights, ways and procedures for their realization and protection*: the lack of bylaws (rules and regulations) that would outline in a step-by-step manner the procedure of realization/enjoyment of academic rights, or, in case of availability of such documents, students' access to them is restricted (they are not published on the web site, are not available in the Dean's Office, etc.).

– *Challenges caused by incompetent administrative staff of the education establishment*: legal incompetence (ignorance of employees about specific provisions of the federal legislation, bylaws and rules of the university, reference to invalid documents, etc.), business and ethical incompetence (rude manner of communication with students, employees refusing to provide detailed explanations, staff

giving reference to a stand, site, other resources, staff providing inaccurate information, deliberate concealment of certain information, etc.), psychological and pedagogical incompetence of staff (failure to provide professional support to students, failure to encourage enjoyment and protection of academic rights), managerial incompetence (forwarding to the wrong employee, abuse of authority, failure to perform one's duties, etc.).

– *Lack of proper conditions for realization of student academic rights at the university.* For example, realization of the student right to design individual syllabus is hampered at many universities by unavailability of student consultants/tutors with focused profiles, student counseling in educational matters and professional induction; other challenges are posed by staff workload norms and guidelines, staffing requirements, etc.

– *Challenges associated with corruption:* employees expecting bribes or tips for delivering specific services in realization of student academic rights. As it has been already mentioned above, oftentimes opportunities for corruption stem from the texts of universities' bylaws and regulations: for example, when such phrases are used as 'as a rule, for a fee', 'at the discretion of the university', etc.

– *Lack of any feedback from administration to the students' petitions and complaints about violation and disrespect of their academic rights.*

#### **6.4.3. Psychological and Pedagogical Challenges**

– *Issues related to unawareness of students about their academic rights or procedures and conditions for their enjoyment.* For example, a student studying for a fee, did not know, that under current law, a student cannot be dismissed from the university in case of academic failure/failed exam and is entitled to formal transfer to the next course, with a sufficient period allowed for re-taking the examination; a student failed to appear at the end-of-term exams and assumed that he was expelled from the university because of this failure, therefore he filed a complaint about the university invoicing him for the tuition fee. Such issues can be attributed to various factors: the student's indifference and inertia, lack of information support from the university, or restricted access to such information, misinformation, access to invalid or unreliable information sources (for example, information from friends, fellow students). The study, conducted at St. Petersburg State University, has identified a great number of respondents who answered that they did not enjoy any rights. In their comments, they indicated that they were not offered any rights (Belova, 2015). A specific problem is in the inadequate information support to undergraduate applicants on issues of their eligibility for academic rights upon admission to the university. The following set of questions arises: who is responsible for informing this category of citizens? Is the university responsible? But the entrants are not its students yet. Is the school responsible? But they have already graduated from the school. Is the state responsible? But then who in particular is representing the state in this capacity? In this regard, applicants often do not have the necessary information on their eligibility to enjoy academic rights upon admission to the university. In particular, many questions arise from foreign citizens, as well as citizens studying abroad, about issues of nostrification and recognition of diplomas.

– *Issues related to the incapacity of students to realize and protect their academic rights.* For example, a student does not know how to write an application, letter, petition, how to compile and file the



necessary documents, how to conduct business communication, how to ask for support from the university leadership, etc.

– *Students inertia in matters of their academic rights*: some students neither show interest in, nor undertake any steps in perusing their rights, and assume that the university is obliged to do everything for realization of their rights. For example, a student has successfully retaken the failed exam within the established timelines, and therefore is eligible for an academic scholarship, however he did not submit to the Dean the necessary confirmation of the exam retaken. Or, a student has applied for transfer to another educational program, and then does not track the application, while filing another application form with some attachments is required, etc.

– *Students' inertia in protection of their academic rights*: it is not uncommon that students are passive in the face of gross violations of their rights at their education establishment (for example, when they are denied readmission, when academic transcript is not issued, when some employees demand bribes, etc.). The research conducted by St. Petersburg University has revealed, that 'when student rights are not respected, the most common students' reaction to such situations is inaction, i.e. no actions are undertaken by students at all (42%). The respondents provided the following typical comments, 'my efforts would make no difference, nobody would listen to me', it is better to do nothing, because otherwise one can only aggravate the situation. More than half of the respondents (53%) believe that one of the main reasons for violations of student rights is the students' own attitudes, for they do not consider their rights as something really significant (Belova, 2015).

– *The students' failure to fulfill commitments associated with academic rights*: for example, a student enrolled in the fee-based program, has demonstrated for two years good or excellent academic performance, and when a vacancy appears in the state-funded (no tuition fee) program, this student misses the deadline established for submitting an application for transfer to this free of charge track; or, let us take another case, when a student did not attend lectures, failed to retake the exams, yet is trying to apply for a sabbatical year.

– *Very low activity of the Student Board and Council in realization and protection of academic rights of students*. Participation of students in realization of their academic rights is gaining more importance in Russia and other advanced countries (the concept of 'student engagement' (Veiga et al., 2014). However, in practice in some cases, the Student Boards' opinions on realization of academic rights are treated in a pro forma manner (merely by inviting the Board to sign the document), while the student councils do not really participate in realization of academic rights of students, do not put forward initiatives on introduction of changes and amendments into regulations and bylaws of the university, do not negotiate with the Administration in the event of a breach or incomplete realization of the student rights, do not participate in informing students about academic rights and in encouraging them to protect their rights by all means, including administrative and court procedures.

– *Students' unjustified expectations of their university's provisions regarding realization of student academic rights*. For example, a student requires transferring him from a fee-based track to the free tuition track of the program, where there are no vacant places. Or, a student demands to transfer him to a different educational program, expecting to be admitted to the same level instead of admission to a

lower level, even though there is an essential incompliance by 10 different disciplines between the academic curricula, i.e. in spite of the provisions outlined in the university bylaws.

## **7. Conclusion**

The above-outlined challenges for realization of academic rights of students require a comprehensive solution. Possible solutions can also be classified into 3 clusters of recommendations, depending on the type of challenges:

### **7.1. Regulatory and Legal Solutions**

– To eliminate contradictions between the federal legislation and legislations of the participating countries of the Bologna process and the CIS countries.

– To develop a unified legal framework for countries participating in the Bologna process and the CIS states, with opportunities for adding amendments and additions reflecting national specifics.

– To compile an inventory of gaps detected in the federal legislation on realization of student academic rights, and to fill these gaps by developing new or upgrading existing regulations.

– To develop at the Ministry of Science and Higher Education some guidelines for higher education establishments regarding the list and content of local bylaws, regulating realization of student academic rights.

– To systematize at the Ministry of Science and Higher Education the main trends of development of higher education in the world and to recommend changes and amendments to the Federal and local regulatory framework with consideration of these trends. At the university level, such changes can be made on the basis of research, reflecting provisions of strategic documents guiding the development of Russian and foreign education, as well as target objectives of the universities development program. In particular, since 2018, the Bachelor and Master programs leading to double diplomas are launched at Sochi State University together with the VATEL International School of Hospitality and Management, following the earlier introduction of necessary amendments in the bylaws of the University.

– To encourage the Ministry of Science and Higher Education to conduct systematic monitoring of realization of student academic rights, on the basis of the monitoring findings to introduce relevant amendments into regulations, to develop recommendations on amendments in internal normative documentation of universities.

– To interview students, administrative staff of universities, teachers, to reflect the findings in amendments and additions to the Federal and University legal framework.

The fundamental legal framework regulating realization of student academic rights is the Federal Law of 29.12.2012 № 273-FZ ‘On Education in the Russian Federation’ (Federal Law, 2012). Proposals on how to improve normative-legal acts, including mechanisms and conditions for realization of academic rights of students, can be presented as a sequence of recommended steps:

1. To clarify the legal status of the main subjects of the educational process – a university and students, because the Russian Federal legislation does not sufficiently regulate the rights, commitments, responsibility of the subjects; in particular, it is important to add to Art. 33 of the Law provisions for such

a specific subject as students with disabilities, who may be eligible for an extended list of rights and their enjoyment; Chapter. 3 should be renamed as follows: 'Subjects Participating in Educational Activities'.

2.To specify a complex of student academic rights, compliance criteria, which will contribute to an unbiased quality assessment. In particular, the criteria may include completeness, timeliness, quality of realization.

3.To specify mechanisms and conditions of realization of student academic rights. To amend the Law by adding parts or articles devoted to mechanisms for realization of academic rights of students. In particular, to amend Art. 34, by renaming it as follows: 'Fundamental Student Rights and Their Guarantees, Measures and Incentives for Their Social Support.' To outline in this Article the conditions necessary for facilitation of realization of student rights, including those related to the objective and subjective factors, which should be detailed in each university depending on the educational process.

4.To specify legal implications for the university in case of its violation of academic rights of students, such as its failure to develop organizational-economic, pedagogical and other conditions that affect the quality, completeness, timeliness of compliance.

5.To specify a complex of conditions that are beneficial for the transition to the individualization of educational process, including measures aimed at promotion of legal literacy of students, starting with an induction course right after the admission, which will disclose specifics of their status as subjects of the educational process.

## **7.2. Administrative and Technical Solutions**

– To create at the federal level an interactive information and methodological resource that will provide official information on emerging issues of student academic rights (this resource may include specific chapters for students, administrative staff and university professors).

– To create and implement social and legal guarantees at universities for realization of student academic rights. The social guarantees involve positive value-based attitudes of all subjects of educational process towards their own academic rights and academic rights of each other. Legal guarantees involve the creation of the local regulatory framework at a university, with relevance to federal legislation, applicable to student academic rights and freedoms and reflecting specific conditions of a particular university.

– To organize training of senior management staff of higher education establishments in the aspects of realization of student academic rights.

– To introduce from the top level of university administration, personal responsibility of officials for violation of student academic rights; to encourage their timely and objective consideration of petitions and applications of students regarding the violation of their academic rights.

– To develop at the Ministry of Science and Higher Education a mandatory list of documents relevant to universities' realization of student academic rights, which should be published on the official website of the university. Currently, of all local acts that are subject to compulsory publication and provide some mentioning of academic rights and freedoms, one can name only internal Codes of Conduct, and the Statutes.

– To organize at the federal level, monitoring of violations of student academic rights which would follow the format of the international project of *Monitoring of Violations of Academic Freedom* based on

the methodology of the *Scholars at Risk-at-Risk* international organization (Scholars at Risk, 2014). Its model can be adapted and implemented in Russia for monitoring violations of academic rights of students.

- To establish some joint supervisory boards of representatives from universities and the Ministry of Science and Higher Education for guiding realization of academic rights of students (following the pattern of supervisory councils of autonomous universities in the Russian Federation).

- To include monitoring of academic rights of students in the state-run accreditation procedure.

- To conduct at universities their internal audits on matters of realization of academic rights of students.

- To conduct independent polls among administrative staff members and students of universities on issues regarding academic rights of students.

- To register and discuss publicly at a university the cases of violations of academic rights and freedoms.

- To provide access for the university community to information on violations and measures to be taken to prevent such cases.

- To introduce at universities incentives for staff members who thoroughly perform their duties on realization of academic rights of students; when taking HR appointment decisions, to take into consideration cases of violations of student academic rights by employees of the university.

- To develop and implement at universities regulations and guidelines on how to handle applications, petitions, complaints submitted by students on issues related to realization of their academic rights and on resolution of conflicts between the parties.

### **7.3. Psychological and Pedagogical Solutions**

- To develop methodological recommendations for student councils at universities on their participation in realization and protection of academic rights of students.

- To include additional content in propaedeutic courses at universities (such as Introduction to Profession, and so on), enlighten students about academic rights and how to enjoy them.

- To establish at universities effective channels of communication between students and administrators in order to create a positive image of the university administration, remove barriers for students' appeals to the administration for clarification or in case of violations of their academic rights.

- To develop universities' corporate culture of teachers, students, administrators based on traditions of respect for and compliance with academic rights and freedoms of each other; promoting the level of employee loyalty and engagement in the organization.

- To conduct, on behalf of student councils, student polls of those learners who have had to refer to specific academic rights, to detect existing problems, to forward requests for solutions to the university administration.

It is possible to forecast, that the content and realization of academic rights of students in future will mostly refer to the scope of bylaws of universities, depending on their degree of transparency, professional integrity of staff, international relations, commitments of employees and students to ethical and professional norms, and proactive attitudes of students in their enjoyment and protection of academic rights.

## Acknowledgments

Our research was performed on the state order assigned to the Sochi State University – ‘The Study of Regulation of Student Academic Rights: Challenges and Development Vectors’ (Project № 27.1268018/12.1).

## References

- Belova, I. Yu. (2015). *Social and legal guarantees of ensuring the academic rights and freedoms of teachers and students in Russian universities*. (Master’s Thesis). Retrieved from <https://www.hse.ru/edu/vkr/170883310> [in Russian].
- Bredneva, V. S. (2009). Legal Aspects of Protection of Students’ Rights. *Molodoi Ucheniy [Young Researcher]*, 11, 198-202.
- Burden, R. (1993). Taking a Human Rights Perspective: Some Basic Implications for the Practicing School Psychologist. *School Psychology International*, 14, 195–98.
- Covell, K., McNeil, J., & Howe, R. (2009). Reducing teacher burnout by increasing student engagement: A children’s rights approach. *School Psychology International*, 30(3), 282–290.
- Federal Law of 29.12.2012 № 273-FZ (2012). «On Education in the Russian Federation» [in Russian].
- Helmholtz, G. (2003). On Academic Freedom of German Universities. *Otchestvenniye Zapiski [Dometic Notes]*, 6, 202-207.
- Kirillovich, A. A. (2017a). Issues of Legal Regulation of Students’ Readmission at Higher Education Establishments. *Zhurnal Russiyskogo Prava [Journal of Russian Law]*, 8, 127-132. doi 10.12737
- Kirillovich, A.A. (2017b). Issues of Administrative and Legal Order for Realization of the Right to Students’ Transfer to Education Establishments. *Zakonodatelstvo I Ekonomika [Legislation and Economics]*, 3, 37-43 [in Russian].
- Kuzminov, Ya. I., & Yudkevich, M. M. (2007). Universities in Russia and America: Differences in Academic Conventions. *Voprosi Obrazovania [Issues of Education]*, 4, 37-41 [in Russian].
- Lazutova, M. N., Mikhailuk, I. F., & Tarasova, V. P. (2003). Comparative Analysis of Laws on Education in the Counties of CIS and the Baltics. *Pravo i Obrazovaniye [Law and Education]*, 5, 101-109 [in Russian].
- Mill, J. S. (2013). *On Liberty and subjection of women*. Indianapolis: Liberty Fund.
- Mutagirov, D. Z. (2014). Problem of Observation of Student Rights and Freedoms. *Vestnil SPbGU [Bulletin of St.Petersburg State University]*, 6(1), 119-125. [in Russian].
- Ortega y Gasset, J. (2010). *Mission of the University*. Moskva: Publishing House of the Higher School of Economics [in Russian].
- Razinkina, E., Pankova, L., Trostinskaya, I., Pozdeeva, E., Evseeva, L., & Tanova, A. (2018). Student satisfaction as an element of education quality monitoring in innovative higher education institution. *E3S Web of Conferences*, 33, 03-43. <https://doi.org/10.1051/e3sconf/20183303043>
- Skiba, R. J., Eckes, S. E., & Brown, K. (2009). African American Disproportionality in School Discipline: The Divide Between Best Evidence and Legal Remedy. *New York Law School Law review*, 10 (59), 1071-1112.
- Scolars at Risk* (2014). Retrieved from <http://monitoring.academicfreedom.info/region/377>.
- Timofeeva, A.A. (2015). Issues of Realization of the Russian Federation Citizens’ Civil Rights for Education under Its Modernization. Theory of New Opportunities. *Vestnik VGUES [Bulletin of VSUES]*, 2 (29), 47-53 [in Russian].
- Veiga, F., Burden, R., Pavlovic, Z., Moura, H., & Galvão, D. (2014). Students’ engagement in school, perceived rights and grade level. *Proceedings of EDULEARN 14 Conference*. Barcelona, Spain.
- Ward, T., & Birgden, A. (2007). Human Rights and Correctional Clinical Practice. *Aggression and Violent Behavior*, 12(6), 628–43.
- Zyngier, D. (2007). Listening to teachers—listening to students: Substantive conversations about resistance, empowerment and engagement. *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice*, 13(4), 327–347.